

To the Honorable Council City of Norfolk, Virginia

February 24, 2022

**From:** George M. Homewood

Director of Planning

**Subject:** Rezoning - The Monument

Companies

**Reviewed:** 

Ward/Superward: 2/7

Patrick Roberts, Deputy City

Manager

Approved:

Item Number: PH-2

Dr. Larry H. Filer II, City Manager

- I. <u>Planning Commission Recommendation:</u> By a vote of **5 to 0**, the Planning Commission recommends **Approval**.
- **II.** Request: Rezoning from IN (Institutional) to MF-NS (Multi-family -Neighborhood Scale) and HL (Historic Landmark). Conditional Use Permit to allow for more than 24 dwelling units.
- III. Applicant: The Monument Companies

# IV. <u>Description:</u>

- The rezoning and conditional use application consists of two sites, the former Park Place Methodist Church and its gravel parking area located across 34th Street.
- The proposed project is to convert the former church into an apartment building containing up to 60 units, with six townhomes located across the street.
- All six townhomes will front Colonial Avenue with their garages accessed from a rear loading alley behind the townhomes.
- The footprint and exterior of the church will remain essentially the same.
- This application also includes a Historic Landmark designation for the older building of the former church.
  - On January 24 the Architectural Review Board (ARB) considered the application to designate the property as a Norfolk Historic Landmark, they unanimously voted 8-0 to recommend approval its designation.
- The project will be required to set aside 6 units (10% of the apartment units) as inclusionary housing units.

- At the January 27 public hearing, Planning Commission voted to continue the item for a month to allow further discussion with the Park Place Business Association who had concerns.
  - On February 3 a meeting was held with the applicant and Park Place Business Association members.
- Citizens who spoke against this agenda item at the Planning Commission's February 24 public hearing objected to the church's conversion to apartments. While the Park Place Methodist congregation have not utilized this site in over four years, other congregations and community outreach groups who are active in the Park Place community have been able to lease or borrow from time-to-time the church building and wish to continue to do so from this location, which the sale and conversion of this site to residential units will preclude.

#### V. <u>Historic Resources Impacts:</u>

The former Park Place Methodist Church is a contributing structure of the state and national historic Park Place district. Its designation as a Historic Landmark will offer additional protection and potential financial assistance with its preservation.

#### VI. Public Schools Impacts:

- School attendance zones include James Monroe Elementary School (45% utilization), Blair Middle School (96% utilization) and Maury High School (93% utilization).
- Seven additional school aged children are projected to be generated by the proposed development of 60 units and 6 townhomes (0.1 school aged children per unit).
- There is sufficient capacity to absorb seven additional students within these schools or across the school system.

Staff contact: Joy Kelling at (757) 664-4756, joy.kirch-kelling@norfolk.gov

#### Attachments:

- Proponents and Opponents
- Staff Report to CPC dated February 24, 2022 with attachments
- Ordinance

# **Proponents and Opponents**

## **Proponents**

Chris Johnson (applicant) 1425 E Cary Street Richmond VA, 23219

Thomas Dickey (applicant) 1425 E Cary Street Richmond VA, 23219

John Porter 439 W 30th Street Norfolk, VA 23508

Marilyn Lipieko 1358 W Ocean View Avenue Norfolk, VA 23503

Tom Mercer 2034 Canning Place Chesapeake, VA 23322

Charles Johnson 3226 Omohundro Avenue Norfolk, VA 23504

Rodney Jordon 304 W 36th Street Norfolk, VA 23508

## **Opponent**

Elizabeth Moore 977 Centerville Turnpike Virginia Beach, VA 23463

Mary Allsbrook 1700 Lambs Creek Lane Virginia Beach, VA 23455

Ronald Atkins 1005 Fitchett Street Chesapeake, VA 23324

Dale White 4700 Colley Avenue Norfolk, VA 23508

Latisha & Joe McDaniel 526 Connecticut Avenue Norfolk, VA 23508



# **City Planning Commission Public Hearing: February 24, 2022**

Executive Secretary: George M. Homewood, FAICP, CFM

Staff Planner: Joy Kirch-Kelling



Staff Report Item No. 2				
Address	500 - 519 34th Street; 500 - 508 Lamberts Point Road			
Applicant	The Monument Companies			
	Rezoning		From IN (Institutional) to MF-NS (Multi-family -Neighborhood Scale) and HL (Historic Landmark)	
	Conditional Use Permit		To allow more than 24 dwelling units	
Neighborhood	Park Place			
Surrounding Area	North	C-C (Co	C-C (Community Commercial): Colonial Pawn Shop	
	East		C-C and MF-NS: Single-family homes, multi- family homes, and Colonial Avenue Park	
	South	IN: Jam	IN: James Monroe Elementary	
	West	C-C and shops	C-C and MF-NS: Single-family homes and retail shops	
Recommendation	Approval with conditions			



#### A. Executive Summary

- This application encompasses two sites; the former Park Place Methodist Church at the northwest corner of 34th Street and Colonial Avenue, and the Church's parking area at the southwest corner of 34th Street and Colonial Avenue.
- The request would allow the former church to be converted into apartments with up to 60 units and the construction of up to six new townhomes across the street and would designate the church as a Norfolk Historic Landmark.
- At the January 27 public hearing, Planning Commission voted to continue the item for a month to allow further discussion with the Park Place Business Association who had concerns.
  - On February 3 a meeting was held with the applicant and Park Place Business Association members.
- Given that the proposed rezoning allows for the adaptive reuse of a contributing historic structure and the addition of townhomes, which are consistent with development in Park Place, staff recommends **approval**.

## **B.** Plan Consistency

- While the proposed rezoning is not consistent with the future land use map, which designates the site as Institutional, an MF-NS designation is congruent with the predominantly residential neighborhood.
- *plaNorfolk2030* also encourages appropriate reuse of existing historic structures and compatible infill housing on vacant or underutilized parcels.

#### C. Zoning Analysis

#### i. General

- This rezoning and conditional use application consists of two sites, the former Park Place Methodist Church and its gravel parking area located across 34th Street.
- The proposed project is to convert the former church into an apartment building containing up to 60 units, with six townhomes located across the street.
- The footprint and exterior of the church will remain essentially the same.
- All six townhomes will front Colonial Avenue with their garages accessed from a rear loading alley behind the townhomes.
- This application also includes a Historic Landmark designation for the older building of the former church.
- The project will be required to set aside 6 units (10% of the apartment units) as inclusionary housing units.

# ii. Performance Standards

# Dwelling, multi-family

- A structure or group of structures other than a townhouse dwelling containing three or more dwelling units located on a single zoning lot, or one or more dwelling units in a mixed-use setting. Units may be located side by side in a horizontal configuration, stacked one above the other in a vertical configuration sharing common vertical walls or horizontal floors and ceilings or both. Multi-family dwellings include what are commonly called apartments, or condominium units, but not townhouse dwellings. A multi-family dwelling in which dwelling units are available for rent or lease for periods of three days or less is considered a hotel or motel, or a short-term rental unit.
  - A Conditional Use Permit is required in the MF-NS, MF-AC, MF-HR, C-N, C-C, C-R,
    D-SP, and G-1 districts, for any development of more than 24 multi-family dwelling units.
  - o Provisions for on-site collection of residents' recyclable solid waste are required.
  - All ground level and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be fully screened from view from public streets and from adjacent Residential districts.

# iii. Development Standards

- Parking
  - o In the Traditional Character District, townhouses are required to provide 1.75 parking spaces per dwelling unit, the preliminary site plan shows two per unit.
  - The parking requirement for an adaptive reuse of an existing building for multifamily use is one per dwelling unit.
    - The site plan shows 60 parking spaces on the former parking lot.

#### Tree Canopy:

The site will be required to be reviewed and approved through the site plan review and comply with the new Tree Canopy requirements of the *Zoning Ordinance*.

#### Flood Zone

Applicant's property is located in the AE (High Risk) and X (Shaded) flood zones. The site will be required to comply with flood zone requirements during Site Plan review.

## D. Historic Landmark Designation

On January 24 the Architectural Review Board (ARB) considered an application to designate the property as a Norfolk Historic Landmark, architectural details that were taken in account were the following:

"This is a two-and-one-half story church designed in the Greek Revival style and constructed in 1949. The building rests on an elevated 4-course American bond brick foundation. The building is 4-course American bond brick construction clad in brick veneer. It is comprised of two blocks; a sanctuary located at the south end and an educational/administrative wing to the north. A monumental portico with stone Corinthian columns supporting a stone pediment and full entablature marks the south façade. The entablature features a modillioned cornice and the pediment features a raking cornice

with modillions and a circular light with traceried lights and articulated surround. The columns rest on squat brick pedestals. The main south entrance is comprised of a double-leaf wood door surmounted by a pediment. The south, east and west walls are marked by two-story, rounded arch stained-glass windows divided by Corinthian pilasters. The windows have stone sills, rowlock-brick surrounds and articulated, scrolled keystones. The pilasters rest on the stone water table above the raised foundation. The roof is deck-on hip clad in slate shingles. There is a cupola on the deck roof with a cross mounted on the copper dome. The four-sided cupola features rounded arch vents with articulated keystones.

"The educational/administrative wing to the north features similar articulation to the main building including, pilasters, water table, entablature, and construction materials. The windows on this block are one story. The first story windows are 6/6, wood, double-hung sash. The second story windows are 6/6, wood, double-hung sash with rounded arch upper sashes. The second story window features rowlock brick surrounds with articulated, stone keystones and springers. Windows punctuate the foundation below the windows found on the first and second stories. The roof is hipped clad in slate shingles. Entrances are found on the foundation level on the north elevation. This building is a contributing resource to the Park Place Historic District."

"This church school is concrete block construction clad in brick veneer and follows the Late 19th and Early 20th Century American Movement style of the primary resource. Constructed in 1924, this building has two blocks similar to the adjacent church. The church and school are connected via two hyphens. The south end of the building is two story and feature an engaged portico. The portico features engaged Corinthian columns supporting a pediment. The portico has three bays and similar features to the adjacent building's portico. There is a two-story stained-glass window centrally located on the south elevation with a rounded arch and articulated keystone. The flanking two bays have paired windows with a common sill on each story. There are foundation windows below each portico bay. The west elevation window openings are boarded. "The north block of the building is four stories. It features a centrally located entrance on the ground story. There is a stone water table, which is broken by the entrance. The water table serves as the foundation window lintels. The north elevation has seven bays. The three central bays feature window openings on the second through fourth stories. The east and west end bays have similar features. The bays adjacent to the end bays have brick panels on the ground story and large brick panels two-stories in height on the second and third stories. There are two stone stringcourses on the north elevation; one serves as the common lintel for the fourth story windows and the other is located above the fourth story windows. The northwest and northeast corners of the north elevation feature brick quoins. The parapet on the north elevation is crenelated and coped in stone. The roof is flat. Windows on this block are 6/6, wood, double-hung sash. The west elevation windows are boarded on the first story. There are two brick chimneys imbedded in the walls. This building is a contributing resource to the Park Place Historic District."

#### ARB Recommendation:

The ARB, unanimously, by an 8-0 vote, approved the designation of the church as a Norfolk Historic Landmark. This property, including its two architectural resources, is contributing to the Park Place Historic District—state/national.

## E. Mobility Analysis

- The property lies on HRT transit lines on 35th Street and Colonial Avenue.
- Sidewalks along 34th Street, 35th Street, and Colonial Avenue are part of a lager neighborhood network.

# F. Historic Resources Impacts

The former Park Place Methodist Church is a contributing structure of the state and national historic Park Place district. Its designation as a Historic Landmark will offer additional protection and potential financial assistance with its preservation.

## **G.** Public Schools Impacts

- School attendance zones include James Monroe Elementary School (45% utilization), Blair Middle School (96% utilization) and Maury High School (93% utilization).
- 7 additional school aged children are projected to be generated by the proposed development of 60 units and 6 townhomes (0.1 school aged children per unit).
- There is sufficient capacity to absorb 7 additional students within these schools or across the school system.

# H. Payment of Taxes

N/A

#### I. Civic League

- The applicant attended the November 15 Park Place Zoning and Improvement Committee meeting.
- The applicant met with the Park Place Business Association in October of 2021
  - On January 2 a letter of concern was received from the Park Place Business Association regarding the lapse of time between the initial meeting and the scheduled January 27 Planning Commission public hearing.
  - On February 3 another meeting was held with the applicant and Park Place Business Association members.
  - A letter of opposition from the Park Place Business Association was received on February 16.

# J. Communication Outreach/Notification

- Letters were mailed to all property owners within 300 feet of the property on January 12.
- Legal notification was placed in *The Virginian-Pilot* on January 13 and 20.

#### K. Recommendation

The adaptive reuse of the former church and compatible infill complies with the goals and objects of *plaNorfolk2030*. The designation as a Norfolk Historic Landmark will allow any future exterior modifications to be reviewed by the ARB. Staff recommends the rezoning,

Conditional Use Permit, and Historic Landmark designation be approved subject to the following conditions:

- a) The site shall be developed in accordance with the *Park Place Methodist Church Adaptive Reuse* conceptual site plan dated November 18, 2021, as prepared by Kimley Horn subject to changes required by Site Plan Review.
- b) The former church complex shall contain no more than 60 units.
- c) No more than six (6) townhomes shall be developed on the site. Townhomes shall front Colonial Avenue with rear loaded garages.
- d) A minimum of six (6) apartment units shall be made available as inclusionary units to individuals and families earning no more than 80% of the then current Virginia Beach-Norfolk-Newport News VA-NC MSA ("Area MSA") median income; provided, however, that the applicant shall not be prevented from renting any inclusionary unit in the ordinary course of its business after such unit has been made available for rent as inclusionary for at least sixty (60) consecutive days. Annually, the applicant must provide the Planning Department with certification that it has complied with this condition

# **Supporting Material:**

- Overview Map(PDF)
- Location Map (PDF)
- Zoning Map (PDF)
- FLU Map (PDF)
- Application (PDF)
- Property Owners 300ft (PDF)
- Email to Park Place Civic League and Park Place Business Association (PDF)
- Email from ParkPlace Z&I (PDF)
- PPCL Monument Letter to Planning Feb 2022 (PDF)
- Feb 16 Ltr of opposition frm PPBAMonument (PDF)
- ERD BOM Seller Support Letter (PDF)
- Park Place UMC Joe McDaniel Itr of opposition (PDF)
- Joe McDaniel supplementary email (PDF)
- Feb 23 Railroad Business Assocation Ltr of Support (PDF)
- Feb 24 Ltr of support Rodney Jordan (PDF)
- Application-CUP (PDF)
- Ordinance Exhibit A (PDF)

Form and Correctness Approved: 240

Contents Approved:

By: \_\_\_\_\_\_

By: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_

NORFOLK, VIRGINIA

# Ordinance No.

AN ORDINANCE TO REZONE PROPERTIES LOCATED AT 501 TO 509  $35^{\text{TH}}$  STREET, 500  $34^{\text{TH}}$  STREET, 501 TO 519  $34^{\text{TH}}$  STREET, AND 500 TO 508 LAMBERTS POINT ROAD FROM IN (INSTITUTIONAL) DISTRICT TO MF-NS (MULTI-FAMILY - NEIGHBORHOOD SCALE) DISTRICT AND TO DESIGNATE THE EXISTING BUILDING AT 500  $34^{\text{TH}}$  STREET AS A NORFOLK HISTORIC LANDMARK.

BE IT ORDAINED by the Council of the City of Norfolk:

Section 1:- That the properties located at  $500~34^{\rm th}$  Street and 501~ to 519~  $35^{\rm th}$  Street are hereby rezoned from IN (Institutional) District to MF-NS (Multi-Family - Neighborhood Scale) District, and the existing building on said property is hereby designated as a Norfolk Historic Landmark (HL). The properties which are the subject of this rezoning are more fully described as follows:

Properties front 200 feet, more or less, along the western line of Colonial Avenue, 150 feet, more or less, along the northern line of  $34^{\rm th}$  Street, and 175 feet, more or less, along the southern line of  $35^{\rm th}$  Street; premises numbered 500  $34^{\rm th}$  Street and 501 to 509  $35^{\rm th}$  Street.

Section 2:- That the properties located at 501 to 519  $34^{\rm th}$  Street and 500 to 508 Lamberts Point Road are hereby rezoned from IN (Institutional) District to MF-NS (Multi-Family - Neighborhood Scale) District. The properties which are the subject of this rezoning are more fully described as follows:

Properties front 176 feet, more or less, along the western line of Colonial Avenue, 275 feet, more or less, along the southern line of  $34^{\rm th}$  Street, and 282 feet, more or less, along the northern line of

Lamberts Point Road; premises numbered 501 to 519 34<sup>th</sup> Street and 500 to 508 Lamberts Point Road.

Section 3:- That the City Council hereby determines that the designation accomplished herein is based on its determination that one or more of the following exist on the property:

- (a) The historic, architectural, or cultural significance, if any, of the building, structure, or site considered on its own merits and which distinguish it from other similar or common buildings, structures or sites in the same vicinity.
- (b) Whether the building, structure, or site is located in an area that is not appropriate or eligible for designation as a local historic district when considered in its entirety.
- (c) The association of the building, structure or site with an historic person or event of national, state, or regional significance or with a renowned architect or master craftsman.
- (d) The age and condition of the building or structure and whether significant portions are at least 50 years old.
- (e) The degree to which the original or distinguishing character, qualities, or materials of a building or structure on the property have been retained and have not undergone changes such that the historical integrity of the property is no longer significantly evident.
- (f) Whether the property has been listed on the U.S. Department of the Interior's National Register of Historic Places or the Virginia Landmarks Register.

Section 4:- That the following summary, describing the distinguishing characteristics and historic significance that are specifically relevant to this historic building, shall serve as a reference for consideration of any application for a certificate of appropriateness:

"This is a two-and-one-half story church designed in the Greek Revival style and constructed in 1949. The building rests on an elevated 4-course American bond brick foundation. The building is 4-course American bond brick construction clad in brick veneer. It is comprised of two blocks; a sanctuary located at the south end and an educational/administrative wing to the north. A monumental portico with stone Corinthian supporting a stone pediment and full columns entablature marks the south façade. The entablature features a modillioned cornice and the pediment features a raking cornice with modillions and a circular light with traceried lights and articulated surround. The columns rest on squat brick pedestals. The main south entrance is comprised of a double-leaf wood door surmounted by a pediment. The south, east and west walls are marked by two-story, rounded arch stained-glass windows divided by Corinthian pilasters. The windows have stone sills, rowlock-brick surrounds and articulated, scrolled keystones. The pilasters rest on the stone water table above the raised foundation. The roof is deck-on hip clad in slate shingles. There is a cupola on the deck roof with a cross mounted on the copper dome. The four-sided cupola features rounded arch vents with articulated keystones.

"The educational/administrative wing to the north features similar articulation to the main building including, pilasters, water table, entablature, and construction materials. The windows on this block are one story. The first story windows are 6/6, wood, double-hung sash. The second story windows are 6/6, wood, double-hung sash with rounded arch upper sashes. The second story window features rowlock brick surrounds with articulated, stone keystones and springers. Windows punctuate the foundation below the windows found on the first and second stories. The roof is hipped clad in slate shingles. Entrances are found on the foundation level on the north elevation. This building is a contributing resource to the Park Place Historic District.

"This church school is concrete block construction clad in brick veneer and follows the Late 19th and Early 20th Century American Movement style of the primary resource. Constructed in 1924, this building has two blocks similar to the adjacent church. The church and school are connected via two hyphens. The south end of the building is two story and feature an engaged portico. The portico features engaged Corinthian columns supporting a pediment. The portico has three bays and similar features to the adjacent

building's portico. There is a two-story stainedglass window centrally located on the south elevation with a rounded arch and articulated keystone. flanking two bays have paired windows with a common sill on each story. There are foundation windows below each portico bay. The west elevation window openings are boarded. "The north block of the building is four stories. It features a centrally located entrance on the ground story. There is a stone water table, which is broken by the entrance. The water table serves as the foundation window lintels. The north elevation has seven bays. The three central bays feature window openings on the second through fourth stories. The east and west end bays have similar features. The bays adjacent to the end bays have brick panels on the ground story and large brick panels two-stories in height on the second and third stories. There are two stone stringcourses on the north elevation; one serves as the common lintel for the fourth story windows and the other is located above the fourth story windows. The northwest and northeast corners of the north elevation feature brick quoins. The parapet on the north elevation is crenelated and coped in stone. The roof is flat. Windows on this block are 6/6, wood, double-hung sash. The west elevation windows are boarded on the first There are two brick chimneys imbedded in the This building is a contributing resource to walls. the Park Place Historic District."

Section 5:- That the official Zoning Map for the City of Norfolk is hereby amended and reordained so as to reflect this rezoning.

Section 6:- The Council hereby finds that this zoning amendment is required by public necessity, convenience, general welfare, or good zoning practice.

Section 7:- That this ordinance shall be in effect from the date of its adoption.